# Liquid-Liquid Equilibrium for the Quaternary System Toluene + Water + Propionic Acid + Ethyl Acetate at $25{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ and Atmospheric Pressure 

Jae-Kyung Kim and Dong-Won Park*<br>Department of Chemical Engineering, Dong-A University, Hadan2-dong, Saha-gu, Busan 604-714, South Korea


#### Abstract

The liquid-liquid equilibrium for the quaternary system toluene + water + propionic acid + ethyl acetate was measured at $25^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ and atmospheric pressure. Binodal curves, tie lines, a distribution curve, and a selectivity curve for the quaternary system have been determined in order to investigate the effect of using binary solvents toluene and ethyl acetate on extracting propionic acid from aqueous solution. In addition, these experimental tie-line data were also compared with the values predicted by the UNIFAC model. It was shown that the UNIFAC model was capable of predicting the compositions of these quaternary systems within an average rmsd of $3.21 \mathrm{~mol} \%$.


## Introduction

With an increase in demand for environmentally friendly materials, the recovery of organic acids from dilute solutions resulting from fermentation processes has become of interest. The economics of the process, however, depends on the development of an effective recovery method for organic acids from the broth. ${ }^{1}$ Solvent extraction processes as a promising recovery technique have been proposed as an alternative to the conventional precipitation process, ${ }^{2}$ and many solvents have been tried to improve such recovery. ${ }^{3-7}$ Propionic acid is being used as a cellulosic solvent in the pharmaceutical industry and also can be used to provide propionates, which are used as fungicides. ${ }^{8}$ It is also used in the electroplating industry and to prepare perfume esters.
The purpose of this work is to determine LLE data of toluene + water + propionic acid + ethyl acetate. The LLE data for the quaternary system were measured at $25^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ and atmospheric pressure. The effect of the mixed solvents to separate propionic acid from aqueous solution was investigated. The system studied was a type C quaternary system, and the ternary systems relevant to the quaternary mixtures at $25^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ have been reported for type 1 systems toluene + water + propionic acid and ethyl acetate + water + propionic acid and the type 2 system toluene + ethyl acetate + water. LLE data have also been predicted with the UNIFAC method, ${ }^{9-11}$ and they are compared with the experimental data at $25^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$.

## Experimental Section

Materials. The toluene, ethyl acetate, and propionic acid used in this work were supplied by Aldrich with a started purity of $99.5 \%$, and ordinary bidistilled water was used. The purity of each of the components was checked by gas chromatography. The GC analysis did not show any appreciable peaks of impurities for all the components and determined $>99.5$ mass fraction purities for toluene, ethyl acetate, and propionic acid. They were used without further purification.

[^0]Quaternary Equilibrium Data Determination. According to the Prausnitz classification, ${ }^{12}$ the quaternary system in this study was formed type C, which contains two ternary LLE mixtures of type 1 having a plait point and one ternary LLE mixture of type 2 having two pairs of partially miscible compounds in the Treybal classification. ${ }^{13}$ The study of the quaternary solubility surface was carried out for a system made up of water, propionic acid, and mixtures of toluene and ethyl acetate in ratios of 100/ $0,75 / 25,50 / 50,25 / 75$, and $0 / 100$ (pseudoternary systems) in mass fraction with the following analytical method. Figure 3 shows the method schematically, where $R$ is the ratio of the solvents. The binodal curves of liquid-liquid equilibrium for four components were described by Prausnitz and Anderson. ${ }^{14}$

The mutual solubility (binodal curve) in toluene + water + propionic acid + ethyl acetate was determined at $25^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ and atmospheric pressure by the cloud-point method as described by Othmer et al. ${ }^{15}$ For the determination of mutual solubility data, an accurately known mass of a homogeneous mixture of two compounds was placed in a thermostated glass-stoppered bottle, one of the nonconsolute compounds was titrated into the bottle from a microburet with an uncertainty of $\pm 0.01 \mathrm{~cm}^{3}$ until the solution became turbid, and the amount titrated was recorded. The bottle was kept in a constant-temperature bath. The temperature of the bath was maintained at $(25 \pm 0.1)^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$. The end point has been confirmed by adding the consolute component until the turbidity disappears. The procedure was repeated to obtain the phase-boundary curve.

For the tie-line measurement, an equilibrium cell was immersed in a thermostat controlled at the desired temperature $\left( \pm 0.1^{\circ} \mathrm{C}\right)$. The pure components were added, and the mixture was stirred for at least 1 h with a magnetic stirrer. The two-phase mixture was allowed to settle for at least 24 h . Samples were taken by a syringe from the upper and lower mixtures. The mixtures of aqueous and organic phases were analyzed on an HP 5890 series II gas chromatograph, equipped with a thermal conductivity detector (TCD). A $1.8 \mathrm{~m} \times 3.2 \mathrm{~mm}$ column packed with Porapack Q was used. The injector and detector temperatures were maintained at $200^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$. The column temperature


Figure 1. Othmer-Tobias plots of toluene (1) + water (2) + propionic acid (3) + ethyl acetate (4) at $25^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ : $\mathbf{\Delta}$, toluene/ethyl acetate (25/75); © toluene/ethyl acetate (50/50); ■, toluene/ethyl acetate (25/75).


Figure 2. Hand plots of toluene (1) + water $(2)+$ propionic acid (3) + ethyl acetate (4) at $25^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ : $\mathbf{\Delta}$, toluene/ethyl acetate (25/75); $\bullet$, toluene/ethyl acetate (50/50); ■, toluene/ethyl acetate (25/75).
was programmed for an initial temperature of $130^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ and a final temperature of $250^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$. The heating rate was $50^{\circ} \mathrm{C} /$ min, and the flow rate of the helium carrier gas was 30 $\mathrm{mL} / \mathrm{min}$. The uncertainty of the mass fraction measurements for the overall composition determination was $\pm 0.002$.

The reliability of measured tie-line compositions was ascertained by making Othmer-Tobias ${ }^{16}$ and Hand ${ }^{17}$ plots for the quaternary system. The plots are presented in Figures 1 and 2. The linear correlation coefficients for the system in ratios of $75 / 25,50 / 50$, and $25 / 75$ in mass fraction as mixed solvents are $0.9992,0.9995$, and 0.9982 in Othmer-Tobias and 0.9997, 09996, and 0.9977 in Hand, respectively. The linearity of the plots (a correlation factor close to 1) indicates the degree of consistency of the related data.

## Results and Discussion

The liquid-liquid equilibrium for the quaternary system toluene + water + propionic acid + ethyl acetate was


Figure 3. Phase equilibrium of toluene (1) + water $(2)+$ propionic acid (3) + ethyl acetate (4). $R_{1}, R_{2}$, and $R_{3}$ denote quaternary sectional planes.


Figure 4. Binodal curves and tie lines of three ternary mixtures making up toluene (1) + water (2) + propionic acid (3), ethyl acetate (1) + water (2) + propionic acid (3), and toluene (1) + ethyl acetate (2) + water (3) at $25^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$.
measured at $25^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ and atmospheric pressure. The quaternary experimental data exhibited type C quaternary LLE behavior as shown in Figure 3 and are composed of two ternary LLE mixtures of type 1 having a plait point (toluene + water + propionic acid and ethyl acetate + water + propionic acid) and one ternary LLE mixture of type 2 having two immiscible binary pairs (toluene + ethyl acetate + water). Figure 4 shows the experimental results for the ternary mixtures constituting the quaternary mixtures toluene + water + propionic acid + ethyl acetate. The mutual solubility data and the equilibrium tie-line compositions measured at $25^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ for the ternary mixtures of toluene + water + propionic acid, ethyl acetate + water + propionic acid, and toluene + ethyl acetate + water are shown in Tables 1 and 2. Quaternary solubility data concerning planes $R_{1}(75 / 25), R_{2}(50 / 50)$, and $R_{3}(25 / 75)$ are given in Table 3, and the tie-line results of the quaternary mixtures for the toluene + water + propionic acid + ethyl acetate system at $25{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ are given in Table 4. The effect of the mixing ratio on the binodal curves for the quaternary system at $25^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ is shown in Figure 5. As shown in Figure 5 , the heterogeneous zone of ethyl acetate was increased with the addition of toluene, but mixed solvents toluene and ethyl acetate in ratios of $75 / 25,50 / 50$, and $25 / 75$ were

Table 1. Binodal Curve Data for the Ternary Systems Toluene (1) + Water (2) + Propionic Acid (3), Ethyl Acetate (1) + Water (2) + Propionic Acid (3), and Toluene (1) + Ethyl Acetate (2) + Water (3)

| $t /{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ | toluene (1) + water (2) + propionic acid (3) |  |  | ethyl acetate (1) + water (2) + propionic acid (3) |  |  | toluene (1) + ethyl acetate (2) + water (3) |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | $100 x_{1}$ | $100 x_{2}$ | $100 x_{3}$ | $100 x_{1}$ | $100 x_{2}$ | $100 x_{3}$ | $100 x_{1}$ | $100 x_{2}$ | $100 x_{3}$ |
| 25 | 84.67 | 15.33 | 0.00 | 97.01 | 2.99 | 0.00 | 95.70 | 0.00 | 4.30 |
|  | 66.22 | 25.91 | 7.87 | 76.25 | 4.78 | 18.97 | 89.95 | 7.5 | 2.55 |
|  | 52.45 | 35.08 | 12.47 | 62.88 | 5.84 | 31.28 | 70.59 | 28.00 | 1.41 |
|  | 43.02 | 41.63 | 15.35 | 52.11 | 9.01 | 38.88 | 32.46 | 64.02 | 3.52 |
|  | 35.76 | 47.23 | 17.01 | 35.00 | 21.00 | 44.00 | 16.13 | 76.90 | 6.97 |
|  | 24.55 | 57.93 | 17.52 | 24.49 | 32.88 | 42.63 | 9.74 | 80.64 | 9.62 |
|  | 15.90 | 68.60 | 15.50 | 15.77 | 45.00 | 39.23 | 0.00 | 84.68 | 15.32 |
|  | 10.07 | 77.81 | 12.11 | 8.48 | 57.79 | 33.73 |  |  |  |
|  | 8.14 | 81.19 | 10.66 | 3.82 | 69.24 | 26.94 | 0.17 | 0.00 | 99.83 |
|  | 4.44 | 89.06 | 6.50 | 1.36 | 79.34 | 19.30 | 0.01 | 0.13 | 99.86 |
|  | 3.06 | 92.44 | 4.49 | 0.61 | 86.73 | 12.66 | 0.01 | 0.32 | 99.66 |
|  | 1.95 | 95.72 | 2.33 | 0.27 | 97.36 | 2.37 | 0.02 | 0.43 | 99.55 |
|  | 0.77 | 99.23 | 0.00 | 0.17 | 99.83 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.77 | 99.23 |

Table 2. Liquid-Liquid Equilibrium Compositions for the Ternary Systems; Toluene (1) + Water (2) +
Propionic Acid (3), Ethyl Acetate (1) + Water (2) +
Propionic Acid (3), and Toluene (1) + Ethyl Acetate (2) + Water (3)

| Toluene (1) + Water (2) + Propionic Acid (3) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| $t /{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ | organic phase |  |  | aqueous phase |  |  |
|  | $100 x_{1}$ | $100 x_{2}$ | $100 x_{3}$ | $100 x_{1}$ | $100 x_{2}$ | $100 x_{3}$ |
| 25 | 90.7700 | 4.3500 | 4.8800 | 0.2100 | 98.2700 | 1.5200 |
|  | 80.1200 | 4.7700 | 15.1100 | 0.3800 | 94.8600 | 4.7600 |
|  | 69.8000 | 4.9800 | 25.2200 | 0.4700 | 91.0700 | 8.4600 |
|  | 58.8500 | 6.7400 | 34.4100 | 0.7100 | 85.9500 | 13.3400 |
|  | 45.9400 | 12.4700 | 41.5900 | 1.4500 | 78.8600 | 19.6900 |
|  | 23.9600 | 33.4200 | 42.6200 | 4.8600 | 66.1000 | 29.0400 |
|  | Ethyl Acetate (1) + Water (2) + Propionic Acid (3) |  |  |  |  |  |
| $t /{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ | organic phase |  |  | aqueous phase |  |  |
|  | $100 x_{1}$ | $100 x_{2}$ | $100 x_{3}$ | $100 x_{1}$ | $100 x_{2}$ | $100 x_{3}$ |
| 25 | 70.4600 | 23.0300 | 6.5100 | 1.2100 | 97.8800 | 0.9100 |
|  | 56.6300 | 32.0900 | 11.2800 | 1.6300 | 96.6200 | 1.7500 |
|  | 44.5000 | 40.6100 | 14.8900 | 2.1200 | 95.1500 | 2.7300 |
|  | 34.9500 | 47.8000 | 17.2500 | 2.7200 | 93.3500 | 3.9300 |
|  | 25.4300 | 56.8900 | 17.6800 | 3.8500 | 90.3900 | 5.7600 |

Toluene (1) + Ethyl Acetate (2) + Water (3)

|  | organic phase |  |  |  | aqueous phase |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| $t /{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ | $100 x_{1}$ | $100 x_{2}$ | $100 x_{3}$ |  | $100 x_{1}$ | $100 x_{2}$ | $100 x_{3}$ |
| 25 | 79.3000 | 19.0100 | 1.6900 |  | 0.0110 | 0.1320 | 99.8570 |
|  | 64.5000 | 33.3900 | 1.9100 |  | 0.0130 | 0.2150 | 99.7720 |
|  | 42.8900 | 53.9600 | 3.0800 |  | 0.0147 | 0.3210 | 99.6643 |
|  | 22.0300 | 72.6500 | 5.3200 |  | 0.0152 | 0.4330 | 99.5518 |

not better than pure solvent toluene as an extraction solvent.

Because the most important factor in liquid-liquid extraction is the selectivity of the solvent, solvents having a higher distribution and selectivity for the solute should be selected after considering the recovery, chemical stability, boiling and freezing points, corrosion, density, and so forth. For this property, the most important factors are distribution and selectivity. They are shown in the following equations.

$$
\begin{equation*}
D=\frac{\text { propionic acid mol \% in solvent layer }}{\text { propionic acid mol \% in water layer }}=\frac{x_{31}}{x_{32}} \tag{1}
\end{equation*}
$$

$S=$
$\underline{\text { propionic acid mol \% in solvent - free solvent layer }}=$ propionic acid mol \% in solvent - free water layer $=$

$$
\begin{equation*}
\frac{x_{31} /\left(x_{31}+x_{21}\right)}{x_{32} /\left(x_{32}+x_{22}\right)} \tag{2}
\end{equation*}
$$

Compositions are expressed in mole fraction $x_{\mathrm{CL}}$, where the first index refers to the component ( $2=$ water, $3=$ propionic acid) and the second index refers to the phase (1 $=$ upper layer, $2=$ lower layer).

Figures 6 and 7 illustrate the effect of the distribution and selectivity for the mixtures in ratios 75/25, 50/50, and
(3)

(2)

Figure 5. Effect of the mixing ratio on binodal curves of the toluene (1) + water (2) + propionic acid (3) + ethyl acetate (4) quaternary system at $25^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$.


Propionic acid mol\% in water layer
Figure 6. Distribution of propionic acid between aqueous and organic phases at $25^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$.

Table 3. Binodal Curve Data for the Toluene (1) + Water (2) + Propinic Acid (3) + Ethyl Acetate (4) Quaternary System

| $t /{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ | $w(1) / w(4)=75 / 25$ |  |  |  | $w(1) / w(4)=50 / 50$ |  |  |  | $w(1) / w(4)=25 / 75$ |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | $100 w_{1}$ | $100 w_{2}$ | $100 w_{3}$ | $100 w_{4}$ | $100 w_{1}$ | $100 w_{2}$ | $100 w_{3}$ | $100 w_{4}$ | $100 w_{1}$ | $100 w_{2}$ | $100 w_{3}$ | $100 w_{4}$ |
| 25 | 74.48 | 0.70 | 0.00 | 24.82 | 49.59 | 0.82 | 0.00 | 49.59 | 24.75 | 1.01 | 0.00 | 74.24 |
|  | 67.33 | 1.27 | 8.98 | 22.42 | 44.69 | 1.68 | 8.94 | 44.69 | 21.98 | 3.27 | 8.79 | 65.96 |
|  | 61.54 | 1.54 | 16.41 | 20.51 | 40.51 | 2.77 | 16.21 | 40.51 | 19.77 | 5.12 | 15.81 | 59.30 |
|  | 52.01 | 2.91 | 27.74 | 17.34 | 33.87 | 5.16 | 27.10 | 33.87 | 17.84 | 7.24 | 21.41 | 53.51 |
|  | 44.63 | 4.78 | 35.71 | 14.88 | 28.83 | 7.75 | 34.59 | 28.83 | 16.24 | 9.06 | 25.98 | 48.72 |
|  | 38.60 | 7.35 | 41.17 | 12.88 | 24.72 | 11.00 | 39.56 | 24.72 | 14.85 | 10.92 | 29.69 | 44.54 |
|  | 33.71 | 10.11 | 44.94 | 11.24 | 21.37 | 14.52 | 42.74 | 21.37 | 13.59 | 13.00 | 32.63 | 40.78 |
|  | 29.61 | 13.14 | 47.38 | 9.87 | 18.61 | 18.11 | 44.67 | 18.61 | 12.48 | 15.14 | 34.94 | 37.44 |
|  | 26.20 | 16.17 | 48.90 | 8.73 | 14.37 | 25.25 | 46.01 | 14.37 | 11.47 | 17.39 | 36.71 | 34.43 |
|  | 20.18 | 21.95 | 51.13 | 6.74 | 11.65 | 30.08 | 46.62 | 11.65 | 7.86 | 28.31 | 40.25 | 23.58 |
|  | 14.03 | 29.03 | 52.26 | 4.68 | 7.67 | 38.48 | 46.18 | 7.67 | 5.04 | 39.92 | 39.91 | 15.13 |
|  | 8.83 | 36.76 | 51.46 | 2.95 | 5.12 | 44.88 | 44.88 | 5.12 | 3.06 | 49.87 | 37.90 | 9.17 |
|  | 6.58 | 41.46 | 49.76 | 2.20 | 3.19 | 52.01 | 41.61 | 3.19 | 1.98 | 57.54 | 34.53 | 5.95 |
|  | 3.18 | 53.20 | 42.56 | 1.06 | 1.84 | 60.20 | 36.12 | 1.84 | 0.96 | 68.68 | 27.48 | 2.88 |
|  | 2.01 | 60.83 | 36.50 | 0.66 | 1.05 | 69.93 | 27.97 | 1.05 | 0.72 | 74.69 | 22.42 | 2.17 |
|  | 1.13 | 75.77 | 22.73 | 0.37 | 0.74 | 75.79 | 22.73 | 0.74 | 0.49 | 81.69 | 16.34 | 1.48 |
|  | 1.06 | 89.63 | 8.96 | 0.35 | 0.71 | 89.62 | 8.96 | 0.71 | 0.46 | 89.22 | 8.93 | 1.39 |
|  | 0.80 | 98.93 | 0.00 | 0.27 | 0.57 | 98.86 | 0.00 | 0.57 | 0.45 | 98.17 | 0.00 | 1.38 |

Table 4. Calculated and Experimental Liquid-Liquid Equilibrium Compositions for the Toluene (1) + Water (2) + Propionic Acid (3) + Ethyl Acetate (4) Quaternary System at $25{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$

|  | organic phase |  |  |  | aqueous phase |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | $100 x_{1}$ | $100 x_{2}$ | $100 x_{3}$ | $100 x_{4}$ | $100 x_{1}$ | $100 x_{2}$ | $100 x_{3}$ | $100 x_{4}$ |
| $x(1) / x(4)=75 / 25$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| exptl | 70.35 | 3.51 | 4.07 | 22.07 | 0.02 | 98.30 | 1.50 | 0.19 |
| calcd | 69.27 | 1.43 | 6.02 | 23.28 | 0.02 | 98.53 | 1.27 | 0.18 |
| exptl | 62.83 | 5.72 | 10.99 | 20.46 | 0.02 | 96.82 | 2.93 | 0.23 |
| calcd | 63.77 | 2.47 | 12.49 | 21.27 | 0.02 | 97.27 | 2.49 | 0.22 |
| exptl | 55.68 | 7.90 | 17.97 | 18.45 | 0.03 | 95.42 | 4.29 | 0.26 |
| calcd | 57.76 | 4.03 | 19.05 | 19.16 | 0.03 | 96.07 | 3.65 | 0.25 |
| exptl | 49.80 | 10.33 | 23.82 | 16.05 | 0.03 | 94.07 | 5.62 | 0.28 |
| calcd | 51.42 | 6.24 | 25.35 | 16.99 | 0.04 | 94.90 | 4.79 | 0.27 |
| exptl | 44.45 | 12.77 | 28.71 | 14.07 | 0.04 | 92.73 | 6.93 | 0.30 |
| calcd | 44.96 | 9.17 | 31.03 | 14.84 | 0.05 | 93.74 | 5.92 | 0.29 |
| $x(1) / x(4)=50 / 50$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| exptl | 43.64 | 8.45 | 5.37 | 42.54 | 0.01 | 97.86 | 1.63 | 0.49 |
| calcd | 44.26 | 3.75 | 7.11 | 44.88 | 0.01 | 98.69 | 0.99 | 0.31 |
| exptl | 38.26 | 12.19 | 12.89 | 36.66 | 0.03 | 96.45 | 2.99 | 0.54 |
| calcd | 39.42 | 6.29 | 14.41 | 39.88 | 0.02 | 97.82 | 1.82 | 0.34 |
| exptl | 32.92 | 16.61 | 18.57 | 31.90 | 0.03 | 95.24 | 4.18 | 0.55 |
| calcd | 34.39 | 9.57 | 21.23 | 34.81 | 0.02 | 97.07 | 2.56 | 0.35 |
| exptl | 28.10 | 20.82 | 23.90 | 27.18 | 0.03 | 94.09 | 5.32 | 0.56 |
| calcd | 29.61 | 13.35 | 27.05 | 29.99 | 0.02 | 96.35 | 3.27 | 0.36 |
| exptl | 24.22 | 25.45 | 27.19 | 23.14 | 0.04 | 92.92 | 6.49 | 0.54 |
| calcd | 25.19 | 17.50 | 31.78 | 25.53 | 0.03 | 95.61 | 4.01 | 0.35 |
| $x(1) / x(4)=25 / 75$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| exptl | 19.11 | 17.54 | 6.95 | 56.40 | 0.02 | 97.81 | 1.37 | 0.80 |
| calcd | 20.60 | 8.65 | 7.77 | 62.98 | 0.01 | 98.85 | 0.72 | 0.42 |
| exptl | 16.00 | 23.96 | 12.59 | 47.45 | 0.02 | 96.71 | 2.46 | 0.81 |
| calcd | 17.70 | 13.20 | 14.98 | 54.12 | 0.01 | 98.26 | 1.30 | 0.43 |
| exptl | 13.28 | 29.66 | 17.99 | 39.07 | 0.02 | 95.71 | 3.45 | 0.83 |
| calcd | 15.03 | 17.94 | 21.02 | 46.01 | 0.01 | 97.72 | 1.83 | 0.44 |
| exptl | 10.82 | 35.81 | 21.33 | 32.04 | 0.02 | 94.70 | 4.46 | 0.82 |
| calcd | 12.69 | 22.58 | 25.87 | 38.86 | 0.01 | 97.17 | 2.38 | 0.44 |
| exptl | 8.78 | 41.51 | 23.65 | 26.06 | 0.04 | 93.61 | 5.54 | 0.82 |
| calcd | 10.67 | 27.02 | 29.60 | 32.71 | 0.02 | 96.57 | 2.97 | 0.44 |

$25 / 75$. As for the binodal curves, they were also not better than the pure solvent, toluene, as an extraction solvent. Perhaps this is because of the higher mutual solubility of
water and ethyl acetate when compared with that for water and toluene. The results indicate that the solubility of toluene is high enough in propionic acid.

UNIFAC-Predicted LLE Data. Because experimental data are often missing or of poor quality, group contribution methods have become increasingly valuable. The great advantage of the group contribution concept is that it is possible to predict a large number of systems using only a relatively small number of group interaction parameters. The most common group contribution method for the prediction of phase equilibrium is UNIFAC. ${ }^{9-11}$


Propionic acid mol\% in solvent-free water layer
Figure 7. Selectivity of propionic acid between aqueous and organic phases at $25^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$.

This model requires two group interaction parameters ( $a_{m n}$ and $a_{n m}$ ) per pair of groups and the group volume and surface area of individual groups for the estimation of the activity coefficient $\gamma_{i}$. The UNIFAC group volume, surface area, and interaction parameters used in this work were

Table 5. UNIFAC Group Volume $\left(\boldsymbol{R}_{\boldsymbol{k}}\right)$, Surface Area $\left(\boldsymbol{Q}_{\boldsymbol{k}}\right)$, and Interaction Parameters $\left(\boldsymbol{a}_{\boldsymbol{n m}}\right)$

|  | $\mathrm{CH}_{3}$ | $\mathrm{CH}_{2}$ | $\mathrm{H}_{2} \mathrm{O}$ | COOH | $\mathrm{CH}_{3} \mathrm{COO}$ | ACH | $\mathrm{ACCH}_{3}$ | $R_{k}$ | $Q_{k}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| $\mathrm{CH}_{3}$ | 0 | 0 | 1300.0 | 139.4 | 972.4 | -114.8 | -115.7 | 0.9011 | 0.8480 |
| $\mathrm{CH}_{2}$ | 0 | 0 | 1300.0 | 139.4 | 972.4 | -114.8 | -115.7 | 0.6744 | 0.5400 |
| $\mathrm{H}_{2} \mathrm{O}$ | 342.4 | 342.4 | 0 | -465.7 | -6.320 | 372.8 | 203.7 | 0.9200 | 1.4000 |
| COOH | 1744.0 | 1744.0 | 652.3 | 0 | -117.6 | 75.49 | 147.3 | 1.3013 | 1.2240 |
| $\mathrm{CH}_{3} \mathrm{COO}$ | -320.1 | -320.1 | 385.9 | 1417.0 | 0 | 114.8 | -170.0 | 1.9031 | 1.7280 |
| ACH | 156.5 | 156.5 | 859.4 | 461.8 | 6.0 | 0 | 167.0 | 0.5313 | 0.4000 |
| $\mathrm{ACCH}_{3}$ | 104.4 | 104.4 | 5695.0 | 339.1 | 5688.0 | -146.8 | 0 | 1.2663 | 0.9680 |

shown in Table $5 .{ }^{18}$
The experimental LLE data and tie lines were compared with predictions obtained by UNIFAC. The rmsd (root-mean-square deviation), deviation of the estimate by experimental compositions, and UNIFAC predictions were obtained from eq 3 for the ternary system and from eq 4 for the quaternary system.

$$
\begin{align*}
& \operatorname{rmsd}_{3}=100\left[\sum_{i=1}^{N} \sum_{j=1}^{3} \sum_{k=1}^{2} \frac{\left(X_{j k}^{\operatorname{exptl}}(i)-X_{j k}^{\mathrm{calcd}}(i)\right)^{2}}{6 N}\right]^{1 / 2}  \tag{3}\\
& \operatorname{rmsd}_{4}=100\left[\sum_{i=1}^{N} \sum_{j=1}^{4} \sum_{k=1}^{2} \frac{\left(X_{j k}^{\operatorname{exptl}}(i)-X_{j k}^{\mathrm{calcd}}(i)\right)^{2}}{8 N}\right]^{1 / 2} \tag{4}
\end{align*}
$$

## Conclusions

Liquid-liquid equilibrium data were determined for the quaternary system toluene + water + propionic acid + ethyl acetate at $25{ }^{\circ} \mathrm{C}$ and atmospheric pressure. The variation of selectivity with mixtures of both solvents is of little significance, with toluene appearing as the better extraction solvent on account of the wide heterogeneous zone in the solubility diagram and the distribution and selectivity curve. The use of mixed solvents in ratios of 75/ $25,50 / 50$, and $25 / 75$ to improve the extraction of propionic acid will be advisable only when both solvents show some favorable properties, such as the distribution coefficient and/or selectivity, in order to take advantage of the synergistic effect of the mixture.

Finally, the experimental data were also compared with the values predicted by the UNIFAC model. In ternary system, the predictions for toluene + water + propionic acid and ethyl acetate + water + propionic acid composed of type 1 were shown within an average root-mean-square deviation of $3.39 \mathrm{~mol} \%$, and the prediction for toluene + ethyl acetate + water composed of type 2 was shown within $1.09 \mathrm{~mol} \%$. For the quaternary system, it was shown that the UNIFAC model was capable of predicting the compositions within an average root-mean-square deviation of 3.21 $\mathrm{mol} \%$.

## Literature Cited

(1) Roychoudhury, P. K.; Srivastava, A.; Sahai, V. Extractive Bioconversion of Lactic Acid. In Downstream Processing Biosurfactants / Carotenoids; Fiechter, A., Ed.; Springer: Berlin, 1995; Vol. 61.
(2) Hartl, R.; Marr, J. Extraction processes for bioproduct separation. Sep. Sci. Technol. 1993, 28, 805.
(3) Dramur, U.; Tatli, B. Liquid-Liquid Equilibria of Water + Acetic Acid + Phthalic Esters (Dimethyl Phthalate and Diethyl Phthalate) Ternaries. J. Chem. Eng. Data 1993, 38, 23-25.
(4) Briones, J. A.; Mullins, J. C.; Thies, M. C. Liquid-Liquid Equilibria for the Oleic Acid- $\beta$-Sitosterol-Water System at Elevated Temperatures and Pressures. Ind. Eng. Chem. Res. 1994, 33, 151-156.
(5) Arce, A.; Blanco, A.; Souza, P.; Vidal, I. Liquid-Liquid Equilibria of the Ternary Mixtures Water + Propanoic Acid + Methyl Ethyl Ketone and Water + Propanoic Acid + Methyl Propyl Ketone. J. Chem. Eng. Data 1995, 40, 225-229.
(6) Fahim, M. A.; Al-Muhtaseb, A. A. Liquid-Liquid Equilibria of the Ternary System Water + Acetic Acid + 2-Methyl-2-butanol. J. Chem. Eng. Data 1996, 41, 1311-1314.
(7) Fahim, M. A.; Al-Muhtaseb, A. A.; Al-Nashef, I. M. Liquid-Liquid Equilibria of the Ternary System Water + Acetic Acid + 1-Hexanol. J. Chem. Eng. Data 1997, 42, 183-186.
(8) Kirk, R. E.; Othmer, D. F. Encyclopedia of Chemical Technology; Interscience Encyclopedia, Inc.: New York, 1947.
(9) Fredenslund, A. Vapor-Liquid Equilibria Using UNIFAC; Elsevier: Amsterdam, 1977.
(10) Gupte, P. A.; Danner, R. P. Prediction of Liquid-Liquid Equilibria with UNIFAC: A Critical Evaluation. Ind. Eng. Chem. Res. 1987, 26, 2036-2042.
(11) Larsen, B. L.; Rasmussen, P.; Fredenslund, A. A Modified UNIFAC Group-Contribution Model for Prediction of Phase Equilibria and Heats of Mixing. Ind. Eng. Chem. Res. 1987, 26, 2274-2286.
(12) Prausnitz, J. M.; Anderson, T. F.; Grens, E. A.; Eckert, C. A.; Hsieh, R.; O'Connell, J. P. Computer Calculations for Multicomponent Vapor-Liquid and Liquid-Liquid Equilibria; Prentice Hall: Englewood Cliffs, NJ, 1980; pp 145-149.
(13) Sorensen, J. M.; Arlt. W. Liquid-Liquid Equilibrium Data Collection; DECHEMA: Frankfurt, 1980; Vol. 5, parts 1-3.
(14) Anderson, T. F.; Prausnitz, J. M. Application of the UNIQUAC Equation to Calculation of Multicomponent Phase Equilibria. 2. Liquid-Liquid Equilibria. Ind. Eng. Chem. Process Des. Dev. 1978, 17, 561-567.
(15) Othmer, D. F.; White, R. E.; Trueger, E. Liquid-Liquid Extraction Data. Ind. Eng. Chem. 1941, 33, 1240-1248.
(16) Othmer, D. F.; Tobias, P. E. Toluene and Acetaldehyde Systems; Tie Line Correlation; Partial Pressures of Ternary Liquid Systems and the Prediction of Tie Lines. Ind. Eng. Chem. 1942, 34, 690700.
(17) Hand, D. B. Dineric Distribution. J. Phys. Chem. 1930, 34, 19612000.
(18) Magnussen, T.; Rasmussen, P.; Fredenslund, A. UNIFAC Parameter Table for Prediction of Liquid-Liquid Equilibria. Ind. Eng. Process Des. Dev. 1981, 20, 331-339.

Received for review October 4, 2004. Accepted November 21, 2004.

JE0496488


[^0]:    * Corresponding author. E-mail: dwpark@daunet.donga.ac.kr.

